

**ATHENS-CLARKE COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

APPLICATION NUMBER..... COA-2025-03-0342

DATE..... March 19, 2025

PETITIONER..... David Matheny/ AMT as agent for Jason Williams

REQUEST..... Modifications to Rear Addition

LOCATION..... 120 W. Cloverhurst Avenue

PROPERTY INFORMATION..... Tax Parcel # 171C3 E010, Bloomfield, RS-8

RECOMMENDATION..... Approval with Condition

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested for modifications to the rear garage addition approved by the HPC in June of 2023 to allow for the addition to be 4 feet taller.

BACKGROUND

Parcel Status: The property is considered contributing to the Bloomfield Historic District. This means that changes on the property are reviewed for their impact on the district and with concern for historic character on the subject property. The Sanborn Maps indicate that the existing historic structure was constructed between 1926 and 1947 including a detached frame garage that was replaced with the existing block and brick structure after 1960 in the same approximate location.

Parcel History: A rear garage addition with guest suite was approved by the HPC in June of 2023. A staff approval to modify the windows on the west elevation dormer was approved in the fall of 2024. This same project had earlier had a 2020 approval of the same project which was never begun and expired. Additionally, there is a 1993 approval of a driveway and parking in what is now a separate parcel to the west and opening a previously enclosed porch. In 2002 approval was given to replace the wood fencing between the front yard brick columns with iron fencing.

Lot Features: The property is located on the northwest corner of the intersection of W. Cloverhurst Avenue and Bloomfield Street. The property has approximately 65' of lot width and 150' of lot depth with the property line chamfered at the intersection. Topographically, the property rises about 6 feet from the southeast to the northwest corners.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The garage addition project was permitted to begin construction in the spring of 2024. In September of 2024, a staff level approval was granted to modify the window openings on the western side dormer. In October of 2024 a complaint from a neighbor came in the Planning Department and a site visit was made. The applicant was alerted of an apparent discrepancy and the owner stopped the construction to allow for a surveyor to determine the actual height. The actual peak of the garage addition was found to be at 25' rather than 21' as approved. This discrepancy was reported as being the result of three actions taken during construction.

1. The garage ceiling height was increased by 1'.
2. The pitch of the gable roof was increased from 10:12 to 12:12.
3. The street level of the new curb cut was found to be an unspecified amount higher than depicted.

The applicant has provided a red-lined east side elevation showing the actual height, but not a complete as-built drawing depicting the structure with the other changes to the roofline and the impact to the size of the dormers.

Additional modifications not denoted in the application include the use of brick up to the height of the window sills, the use of a wider breezeway connection than on the approved design, and a brick wall with some degree of retention on the north side of the property.

RECOMMENDATION

Review of this application would utilize the general Design Guidelines, specifically Section 4F related to additions as new construction.

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4F: Additions: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Scale and Massing• Location and Orientation• Materials• Details	Partly	<p>The modifications requested largely apply to scale and details with the other review criteria unaffected by the changes that have been made. The scale of the addition has seen significant increase from the approved plans. The eastern side dormer facing Bloomfield Street particularly increases the visibility and impact of the change in scale with the window size and the height of the eave drawing the eye. The impact of the change in scale is much less significant at the other elevations.</p> <p>The detail of greater brick use than a small height to mimic a foundation level for this slab construction is not typical of area or the historic structure.</p>
3B: Fencing and Walls	Yes	<p>The brick wall at the north end of the property is a material that relates to the existing materials on site and its placement to begin well back from the right-of-way line diminishes its impact on the character of the property.</p>

Staff finds that the increase in height of the addition in both wall height and roof height has a significant impact on the character of this corner structure. The majority of the impact is seen at the Bloomfield Street elevation with the dormer's wall plane and eave height. Staff recommends approval of the changes with a condition that the east dormer be removed from the structure.

This recommendation is made to address the design guidelines noted above, as well as Section 8-5-5 D (1) of the Athens-Clarke County Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Acceptable Historic Preservation Commission Reaction to an Application for Certificate of Appropriateness.

REPORT FOR:	120 W. Cloverhurst Avenue	
In evaluating the attached report, the following standards, which are checked, were considered in making a recommendation. Items that are not applicable are marked as such. More detailed descriptions of each item are included in the attached report.		
REVIEWED	NOT APPLICABLE	
X		1. HISTORIC USES OF PROPERTY
X		2. NECESSITY OF PROPOSED CHANGES
X		3. INTEGRITY OF HISTORIC RESOURCE
		4. THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE CHANGE WILL AFFECT:
X		A. INTEGRITY OF THE BUILDING
X		B. INTEGRITY OF THE AREA
X		5. ORIGINAL AND CURRENT USES

Worksheet for 120 W. Cloverhurst Avenue

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4F: Additions: • Scale and Massing • Location and Orientation • Materials • Details		
3B: Fencing and Walls		