

**ATHENS-CLARKE COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

APPLICATION NUMBER..... COA-2024-11-2342
DATE..... December 18, 2024
PETITIONER..... Harrison Design Associates as agent for Dan & Beth Ann Valavanis
REQUEST..... Rear Addition
LOCATION..... 180 Woodlawn Avenue
PROPERTY INFORMATION..... Tax Parcel # 124B2 G019, Woodlawn, RS-15
RECOMMENDATION..... Approval with Conditions

REQUEST

The purpose of this request is to seek approval for a new rear addition to replace an existing rear porch as well as an addition of a dormer to the front elevation and extension of patio area.

BACKGROUND

Parcel Status: The property is considered contributing to the Woodlawn Historic District, which means that changes on the property are reviewed for their impact on the district only and with concern for the historic character on the subject property.

Parcel History: Previous Certificates of Appropriateness on file for this property include a 1993 approval to restore a side porch and a 1998 approval for a detached garage, which was never built. Sanborn Maps indicate that the main structure was constructed by 1926. The City Directories suggest construction about 1922.

Lot Features: The subject property is located on the north side of Woodlawn Avenue; the second property facing Woodlawn Avenue west of Milledge Avenue. The property has approximately 80 feet of lot width and about 209 feet of lot depth. Topographically, the property is relatively flat at the front half of the property with a rise of about 7 feet to the northeast corner at the rear half of the property.

EVALUATION

This request involves removal of the existing rear addition at the northwest corner of the house to allow for a new two-story addition at that location in addition to adding a second level to the existing eastern area of the rear of the house and a new rear porch. Additionally, dormers would be added at the front elevation and the rear slope of the existing side porch. The proposed changes at each elevation are as described below:

Front (south): The front elevation would see a gable dormer added just east of the front entry cover. The dormer would have a width of about 4.5' with a single window taking up most of that space. Faux timbering would be used in the gable. The two skylights would also be removed from the front roofline.

Left (west): The existing single-story extension at the rear of this side elevation would be removed. This area has a recess of about 6 inches from the original rear corner and about 12 feet in length. There are no openings on the stucco wall divided into three panels with faux timbering. The foundation has horizontal

skirting typical of a porch. The Sanborn Maps indicate this area as an open porch. It is unclear when it was enclosed and the open extension to the east added.

The proposed two-story addition would be at the same wall plane without the recess of the current to be removed. The addition would continue the same roofline, eaves line, and wall cladding with brick on the first level and stucco above a wood beltline. The addition would be 22' in length. Openings would be limited to one window near the northern end of the addition on the first level. Additionally, several openings on the existing wall plan south of the addition would be removed. The upper level would see the window at the southern end abutting the gable extension. The ground floor would see the window in this same location eliminated as well. Further, the two larger windows on the ground floor would be reduced to a single window that is aligned with that remaining on the upper level. Of note is that the Sanborn Maps indicate the upper level behind the gable extension as an open porch through 1960.

Right (east): The existing conditions include a single-slope roofline extending northward about 16' from the rear slope of the main side gable roofline composing the front of the home. This area is shown as in place by 1926 on the Sanborn Maps. It is unclear when the shed dormer over this area was added.

The proposed addition would include a new rear gable addition over this ground level area with a new complex dormer at the newly created corner and a gable dormer over the eastern end of the existing side porch. The new rear gable would extend over the 16' existing single-story area and an additional 18' to the north. The wall plane would not include any recess from that existing rear corner. A large brick chimney would be located at the center of the new addition and be flanked by a single glazed door to each side. The flanking doors would have a head height slightly lower than the windows to the existing to the south. At the north end would be a new rear porch with a hipped roofline. The porch would utilize brick corner piers and brick knee walls with wood posts to match those found on the existing historic side porch. (Note that the as-built elevations show these for the front only but they are found on all three sides currently.) Through the open porch would be visible the northern end of the extension of the western rear gable with a single window visible. Openings at the upper level would include a paired window on the gable portion of the complex dormer.

Rear (north): The rear elevation currently includes the rear gable extension having two levels, a shed dormer to its east, and the one level single slope area north of the dormer. A single level enclosed porch and open porch are north of these areas.

The proposed plan would extend the existing rear gable about 22' which would be 6' further than the extension of the new rear gable to its east. The single level open rear porch would then extend about 12' or 6' further than the new rear wall plane to the west. The new rear gable would also be about 2.5' lower than the existing one being extended as it would not exceed the height of the existing roof beyond. A new single slope area would be used between the two gables to allow for consistent upper-level living space. The rear elevations of both gables would utilize faux timbering similar to that found on the front gable currently. The extended gable to the west would have a bank of three windows at both levels. The new gable area would have a single narrow window centered in the gable and a bank of 4 sliding glazed doors opening onto the new porch. The new dormer over the side porch would be about 8' in width and utilize a paired window with faux timbering in the gable.

Site Changes: An existing brick patio to the east side of the house would be extended to the north to align with the new rear porch. No other site changes are indicated on the plans.

Materials:

- Roofing: Asphalt shingle roofing existing to be used for all new areas except for standing seam copper roofing at the crickets between the two rear gables and at the new rear porch. Brick for the new chimney. Gutters are neither existing, nor proposed.
- Siding and Trim: Brick to match the existing to be used for the ground level areas. Stucco and faux timbering of upper areas and dormers to match the existing front gable and west side except that the wood trim piece outlining the original opening of the upper porch has been eliminated. Trim and moulding on eaves to match the existing.
- Windows: Existing windows are wood and double-hung with divided lights. These include 4-over-4 at a few narrow windows and 6-over-6 for most openings. Most existing openings are single windows though two examples of paired windows exist on the front elevation and one triple window on the west side. All new windows to match the existing in materials and configuration. (Note that use of true divided lights is not clearly stated.)
- Foundation: Continuous brick foundation to match that existing is to be brick faced CMU.
- Porches: New rear porch to match the brick columns and wood posts of the existing side porch.
- Hardscape: Extension of existing brick patio area.

RECOMMENDATION

Review of this application would follow the general set of Design Guidelines, including Chapter 4F regarding Additions as New Construction and Chapter 2A.8 regarding dormers and 2B.8 regarding window rhythm and solid-to-void ratio. Chapter 5 regarding historic additions and demolition or significant alteration is also relevant.

	Met?	Comments
2A.8: Dormers	Mixed	Dormers should not be added or removed at primary facades per the Design Guidelines. However, photo documentation provided with a 1993 application shows that a dormer of similar proportions but a flat roofline previously existed near the proposed dormer location. An effort to date the photograph was unsuccessful and it is unclear if the dormer was original or a later change. The proposed gable dormer does have a clearer relationship to the structure and its architecture than that in the photograph. The known former condition does lessen the impact of the proposed dormer on the character of the structure. The dormers proposed for the rear areas are of appropriate scale, massing, details and materials.
2B.8: Window Rhythm and Solid-to-Void Ratio	No	The elimination of three window openings on the left (west) side elevation has a significant impact on the rhythm of openings and the solid-to-void ratio of this area on the historic area of the home.
4F: Apply New Construction Standards to Additions	Partly	The massing of the addition into various rooflines does temper the perceived scale of the addition, which is limited to the rear of the structure. The addition areas do not read clearly as later changes with distinct forms from the existing given the lack of recess of the wall planes. The solid-to-void ratio and rhythm of openings is low at the western side elevation. The use of matching detailing for the new rear porch to the historic side porch is appropriate. The use of faux timbering is appropriate though that proposed does far exceed the amount currently found which includes only the upper-level gable area

		at the front elevation and above the window in the gable of the extension on the west side elevation. A reduction in the level of this detail is recommended.
5: Demolition	Mostly	The area proposed to be removed has clearly been altered from its historic appearance as an open porch which does limit the degree to which it adds importance or significance to the historic structure. It is not crucial to the continued use or function of the structure, though the condition of this area is not cited as a reason for its proposed removal.

Staff finds the proposed addition largely meets the Design Guidelines. Staff recommends that the project be **approved** with the following conditions:

- The addition area be modified to be distinct from the historic construction.
- The left side elevation be modified to improve the solid-to-void ratio and rhythm of openings with the original window openings being retained and more added on the addition in coordination with Planning Staff.
- The left side elevation retain the detailing on the upper level of the knee wall and corner board.
- The faux timbering detailing added to the property be reduced to better align with the historically-appropriate level of this form of detailing.

This recommendation is made to address the design guidelines noted above, as well as Section 8-5-5 D (1) of the Athens-Clarke County Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Acceptable Historic Preservation Commission Reaction to an Application for Certificate of Appropriateness.

REPORT FOR:		180 Woodlawn Ave.
In evaluating the attached report, the following standards, which are checked, were considered in making a recommendation. Items that are not applicable are marked as such. More detailed descriptions of each item are included in the attached report.		
REVIEWED	NOT APPLICABLE	
X		1. HISTORIC USES OF PROPERTY
X		2. NECESSITY OF PROPOSED CHANGES
X		3. INTEGRITY OF HISTORIC RESOURCE
		4. THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE CHANGE WILL AFFECT:
X		A. INTEGRITY OF THE BUILDING
X		B. INTEGRITY OF THE AREA
X		5. ORIGINAL AND CURRENT USES

180 Woodlawn Ave. Review Worksheet

	Met?	Not Met?	Comments
2A.8: Dormers			
2B.8: Window Rhythm and Solid- to-Void Ratio			
4F: Apply New Construction Standards to Additions			
5: Demolition			