

ATHENS-CLARKE COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPLICATION NUMBER..... COA-2024-10-2156

DATE..... November 20, 2024

PETITIONER..... Katrina Evans/ E+E as agent for CM Chen & Assoc. Corp.

REQUEST..... Modify Accessory Structure

LOCATION..... 146 Mell Street

PROPERTY INFORMATION..... Tax Parcel # 173A1 D011, Bloomfield, RS-8

RECOMMENDATION..... Approval with Conditions

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested for the modification of an accessory structure in the rear yard of this property to include replacing the roof with a new roofline.

BACKGROUND

Parcel Status: The property is considered contributing to the Bloomfield Historic District, which means that changes on the property are reviewed for their impact on the district only and with concern for the historic character on the subject property.

Parcel History: No previous Certificates of Appropriateness are on file for this property. Sanborn Maps indicate that the main structure was constructed between 1913 when Mell Street was first included in the area mapped.

Lot Features: The subject property is located on the western side of Mell Street and is the first parcel facing Mell Street south of the intersection with Cloverhurst Avenue. The property has approximately 70 feet of lot width at Mell Street and an average lot depth of about 180 feet. Topographically, the property rises about 2 feet from north to south.

EVALUATION

This request involves the modification of a secondary structure in the rear yard. The application refers to the building a cottage. The structure has a main area of 25'8" x 18'7" with an extension on the southern side of 6'1" x 8'3.5". The structure currently has a gable roofline at the main area with a single slope over the extension. However, it appears as if this is a modification to a design originally having a single slope over the entire structure with the tall side at the front (north). The building appears to have a solid masonry foundation of a concrete brick. It is unclear if the rear foundation includes some retention or has seen settling, but there is currently little foundation seen above grade at the southeast of the structure.

The proposed modifications include removing the existing roof form over the entire structure and replacing it with gable rooflines separately over the main area and the extension. This main area is shown as having a height of 13'4" to the new roof peak. The use of cementitious lap siding with a 6" reveal is shown for the new gable areas created. Asphalt shingles would be used for the roofing with a ridge vent. Gutters are depicted on the plans but not called out for form or material.

A new front door is proposed to replace that existing. That depicted has a divided light upper half with two vertical panels below and noted as painted wood. A new concrete stoop is shown for accessing the door along with a new gable roofline covering the entry. This gable cover is to be supported by brackets and utilize an unspecified metal roofing.

The plans note that the existing asbestos siding is to be retained. It is unclear if new cementitious replacement siding is to be used to even out the wall height from the original single slope form that composes the walls.

The structure can clearly be seen on the 1978 aerial images with the 1964 images suggesting its presence but being less distinct. The tax records indicate a construction date of 1946, however that is not accurate unless the building was later moved to this location on the property as it is not on the 1946 aerial or on the Sanborn Maps. City Directories first include a 146 1/2 Mell St. in 1954 with no mention of this address in 1952 when the property was still owner occupied. This suggests that the building was first in this location and used for a dwelling about 1954. This date is outside of the period of significance for the Bloomfield Historic District but does speak to the introduction of apartment buildings into the neighborhood around that time.

RECOMMENDATION

Review of this application would follow the general set of Design Guidelines, including Chapter 3E regarding accessory structures.

	Met?	Comments
3E: Accessory Structures	Mostly	<p>The proposed changes would not alter the placement or orientation of the existing accessory structure. The scale would not have any significant change with the proposed roofline and the massing would remain as it exists. The materials would be largely as existing aside from lap siding within the new gables. The cementitious material would allow for the condition to be perceived as a later change. The metal roofing with bracket support would similarly be easily seen as a later change. Were the building contributing to the district, the loss of the understanding of the single-slope roof would be a concern.</p> <p>However, as a non-contributing structure on a contributing parcel this is not necessary to protect the character of the property or district. The resulting change to even wall heights with the new roofline just requires some additional information about the materials involved and some unclear aspects such as the use of gutters.</p>

Staff finds the proposed addition largely meets the Design Guidelines. Staff recommends that the proposed changes be approved with the following conditions:

- Details be provided regarding the wall changes necessary to adjust the roofline.
- Details be provided regarding the use of gutters.

This recommendation for **approval** is made to address the design guidelines noted above, as well as Section 8-5-5 D (1) of the Athens-Clarke County Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Acceptable Historic Preservation Commission Reaction to an Application for Certificate of Appropriateness.

REPORT FOR:	146 Mell Street	
In evaluating the attached report, the following standards, which are checked, were considered in making a recommendation. Items that are not applicable are marked as such. More detailed descriptions of each item are included in the attached report.		
REVIEWED	NOT APPLICABLE	
X		1. HISTORIC USES OF PROPERTY
X		2. NECESSITY OF PROPOSED CHANGES
X		3. INTEGRITY OF HISTORIC RESOURCE
		4. THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE CHANGE WILL AFFECT:
X		A. INTEGRITY OF THE BUILDING
X		B. INTEGRITY OF THE AREA
X		5. ORIGINAL AND CURRENT USES

146 Mell Street Review Worksheet

	Met?	Not Met?	Comments
3E: Accessory Structures			